

| ENGINEERING SERVICES FOR FREDERICA ROAD RFP 01051 |               |                    |                        |                              |                    |                     |                     |                |
|---|---------------|--------------------|------------------------|------------------------------|--------------------|---------------------|---------------------|----------------|
| COMPANY   | Qualification | Mgmt<br>Philosophy | Implementation<br>Plan | Experience<br>Subcontractors | TECHNICAL<br>TOTAL | LOCAL<br>PREFERENCE | COST /<br>FINANCIAL | TOTAL<br>SCORE |
| EMC   | 29.17         | 11.50              | 28.00                  | 10.83                        | 79.50              | 0.00                | 0.00                | 79.50          |
| POND  | 29.17         | 11.50              | 29.17                  | 10.83                        | 80.67              | 0.00                | 0.00                | 80.67          |
| THOMAS<br>&HUTTON                                 | 28.00         | 12.00              | 26.83                  | 10.40                        | 77.23              | 0.00                | 0.00                | 77.23          |
| MORELAND<br>ALTOBELLI                             | 25.67         | 11.50              | 22.17                  | 9.97                         | 69.30              | 0.00                | 0.00                | 69.30          |
| ALFRED<br>BENESCH                                 | 23.33         | 11.00              | 24.50                  | 9.53                         | 68.37              | 0.00                | 0.00                | 68.37          |
| IDS GLOBAL  | 22.17         | 8.50               | 18.67                  | 7.80                         | 57.13              | 0.00                | 0.00                | 57.13          |

**Awarded**

**To: THOMAS & HUTTON**

**Awarded**

**On: 12/21/2017; BOC #28**

| ENGINEERING SERVICES FOR FREDERICA ROAD RFP 01051 |                      |                |                       |                     |                            |                 |
|---|----------------------|----------------|-----------------------|---------------------|----------------------------|-----------------|
| COMPANY   | EVALUATOR            | QUALIFICATIONS | MANAGEMENT PHILOSOPHY | IMPLEMENTATION PLAN | EXPERIENCE/ SUBCONTRACTORS | TECHNICAL SCORE |
| <b>EMC ENGINEERING</b>                            |                      |                |                       |                     |                            |                 |
|   | 1                    | 31.5           | 12                    | 31.5                | 11.7                       | 86.7            |
|   | 2                    | 31.5           | 13.5                  | 28                  | 10.4                       | 83.4            |
|   | 3                    | 24.5           | 9                     | 24.5                | 10.4                       | 68.4            |
|   | <b>AVERAGE SCORE</b> | <b>29.17</b>   | <b>11.50</b>          | <b>28.00</b>        | <b>10.83</b>               | <b>79.50</b>    |
| <b>POND CO</b>                                    |                      |                |                       |                     |                            |                 |
|   | 1                    | 28             | 10.5                  | 31.5                | 11.7                       | 81.7            |
|   | 2                    | 35             | 12                    | 31.5                | 11.7                       | 90.2            |
|   | 3                    | 24.5           | 12                    | 24.5                | 9.1                        | 70.1            |
|   | <b>AVERAGE SCORE</b> | <b>29.17</b>   | <b>11.50</b>          | <b>29.17</b>        | <b>10.83</b>               | <b>80.67</b>    |
| <b>THOMAS &amp; HUTTON</b>                        |                      |                |                       |                     |                            |                 |
|   | 1                    | 31.5           | 12                    | 28                  | 11.7                       | 83.2            |
|   | 2                    | 28             | 13.5                  | 28                  | 10.4                       | 79.9            |
|   | 3                    | 24.5           | 10.5                  | 24.5                | 9.1                        | 68.6            |
|   | <b>AVERAGE SCORE</b> | <b>28.00</b>   | <b>12.00</b>          | <b>26.83</b>        | <b>10.40</b>               | <b>77.23</b>    |
| <b>MORELAND ALTOBELLI</b>                         |                      |                |                       |                     |                            |                 |
|   | 1                    | 24.5           | 10.5                  | 24.5                | 10.4                       | 69.9            |
|   | 2                    | 24.5           | 13.5                  | 21                  | 9.1                        | 68.1            |
|   | 3                    | 28             | 10.5                  | 21                  | 10.4                       | 69.9            |
|   | <b>AVERAGE SCORE</b> | <b>25.67</b>   | <b>11.50</b>          | <b>22.17</b>        | <b>9.97</b>                | <b>69.30</b>    |
| <b>ALFRED BENESCH</b>                             |                      |                |                       |                     |                            |                 |
|   | 1                    | 24.5           | 10.5                  | 24.5                | 10.4                       | 69.9            |
|   | 2                    | 24.5           | 10.5                  | 24.5                | 10.4                       | 69.9            |
|   | 3                    | 21             | 12                    | 24.5                | 7.8                        | 65.3            |
|   | <b>AVERAGE SCORE</b> | <b>23.33</b>   | <b>11.00</b>          | <b>24.50</b>        | <b>9.53</b>                | <b>68.37</b>    |
| <b>IDS GLOBAL</b>                                 |                      |                |                       |                     |                            |                 |
|   | 1                    | 21             | 7.5                   | 17.5                | 7.8                        | 53.8            |
|   | 2                    | 24.5           | 10.5                  | 21                  | 9.1                        | 65.1            |
|   | 3                    | 21             | 7.5                   | 17.5                | 6.5                        | 52.5            |
|   | <b>AVERAGE SCORE</b> | <b>22.17</b>   | <b>8.50</b>           | <b>18.67</b>        | <b>7.80</b>                | <b>57.13</b>    |

\*E-3: MINIMAL GDOT EXPERIENCE- ALFRED BENESCH

| <b>ENGINEERING SERVICES FOR FREDERICA ROAD RFP 01051</b> |                    |                     |                            |                           |                       |                    |
|--|--------------------|---------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------|--------------------|
| <b>PROPOSER NAME</b>                                     | <b>EMC</b>         | <b>POND</b>         | <b>THOMAS &amp; HUTTON</b> | <b>MORELAND ALTOBELLI</b> | <b>ALFRED BENESCH</b> | <b>IDS GLOBAL</b>  |
|  | <b>\$86,500.00</b> | <b>\$117,200.00</b> | <b>\$53,500.00</b>         | <b>\$79,670.00</b>        | <b>\$111,161.37</b>   | <b>\$77,000.00</b> |
| High/Low Variance  | -\$33,000.00       | -\$63,700.00        | \$0.00                     | -\$26,170.00              | -\$57,661.37          | -\$23,500.00       |
| Value of 1 point<br>(6,370.00)                           |                    |                     |                            |                           |                       |                    |
| Grade Reduction  | 5.18               | 10.00               | 0.00                       | 4.11                      | 9.05                  | 3.69               |
| Point (Max. 10)  | 4.82               | 0.00                | 10.00                      | 5.89                      | 0.95                  | 6.31               |
| Fee Grade (pts x 0)                                      | 0.00               | 0.00                | 0.00                       | 0.00                      | 0.00                  | 0.00               |

| <b>TASKS</b>                             | <b>EMC</b>          | <b>POND</b>          | <b>THOMAS &amp; HUTON</b> | <b>MORELAND ALTOBELLI</b> | <b>ALFRED BENESCH</b> | <b>IDS GLOBAL</b>   |
|--|---------------------|----------------------|---------------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------|---------------------|
| 001 - Site Analysis Phase                | \$ 7,500.00         | \$ 14,430.00         | \$ 12,500.00              | \$ 23,655.00              | \$ 45,581.58          | \$ 25,000.00        |
| 002 - Conceptual Development Phase       | \$ 35,000.00        | \$ 33,670.00         | \$ 8,500.00               | \$ 10,000.00              | \$ 23,899.75          | \$ 20,000.00        |
| 003- Construction Plan Development Phase | \$ 30,000.00        | \$ 48,100.00         | \$ 24,000.00              | \$ 29,015.00              | \$ 23,680.04          | \$ 22,000.00        |
| Option 1 - Task 001 Construction Phase   | \$ 14,000.00        | \$ 21,000.00         | \$ 8,500.00               | \$ 17,000.00              | \$ 18,000.00          | \$ 10,000.00        |
| <b>TOTAL PROJECT COST</b>                | <b>\$ 86,500.00</b> | <b>\$ 117,200.00</b> | <b>\$ 53,500.00</b>       | <b>\$ 79,670.00</b>       | <b>\$ 111,161.37</b>  | <b>\$ 77,000.00</b> |